

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY

VOL. 45, No. 16

182

MARCH 31, 1952

WHOLE No. 1150

CONTENTS

Editorial Announcement	257
L. A. MacKAY: Three Notes on Virgil	257
EMILIE MARGARET WHITE: Award of C. A. A. S. Rome Scholarship for 1952	259
Reviews	259
F. M. Cornford, <i>The Unwritten Philosophy and Other Essays</i> ; W. K. C. Guthrie, <i>The Greek Philosophers</i> (Greene); I. Plant and S. Darré, <i>Méthode naturelle pour l'enseignement du grec</i> ; S. Darré, <i>Une année en Attique</i> (Gillespie); G. Nencioni, <i>Ipponatte</i> (Whatmough).	
Index to Volume 45; Errata	263

EDITORIAL ANNOUNCEMENT

This issue, the last of Volume 45, is also the last to be published under the direction of the present Editor. The pressure of administrative work involved in a deanship at Hunter College in the Bronx, upon the duties of which he entered in September 1951, makes it impossible for him to continue his work with THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY beyond the end of the present volume. His regret at terminating his connection with *CW* is tempered by the prospect of returning to his own research, from which he has been kept almost entirely for the last three years by his editorial and teaching duties, and, during the last year, by his administrative tasks as well.

The triennium which he has spent as Editor of the WEEKLY has been a most rewarding one. Perhaps the most gratifying aspect of this experience has been the opportunity to come into contact with the many scholars whose articles and reviews have appeared in the three volumes. To them, and to the staff whose able and loyal support has been an unfailing source of strength and encouragement, the Editor offers his renewed expressions of gratitude. He is particularly grateful both to Professor Edward A. Robinson of Fordham University, who rendered splendid service to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY as Associate Editor for Volumes 43 and 44, and to Dr. Ellenor Swallow of Barnard College, who, during Professor Robinson's absence on leave, has ably filled his post for the current volume.

H. L. L.

THREE NOTES ON VIRGIL

Sunt lacrimae rerum...
(*Aen.* 1.462)

No one need expect to be welcome who lays innovating hands on the sacred emotional resonance of this phrase, the more treasured by romantic hearts for its very vagueness. Yet it may be possible to dispel the vagueness with no impairment, even with increase of the line's appositeness and poignancy.

That *rerum* is a predicate genitive, and that the verse expresses not particular sympathy for the Trojans but a general reflection concerning human sympathy, as Henry contends in his *Aeneidea*, is a view that has not won wide acceptance. H. Williams¹ and A. L. Keith² argue persuasively against generalization, and Keith disposes easily of Henry's reference to Venantius. C. A. Vince³ cuts the ground from Henry's objection that *res* without adjunct cannot mean *res adversae* by suggesting that in this context *rerum* can easily be understood as *rerum mortalium*.

Yet there is a sense in which Henry's syntactical insight⁴ may be vindicated. His close translation of the phrase *sunt lacrimae rerum* as "tears are a part of the constitution of nature" may be interpreted not only gen-

¹ *CR* 33 (1919) 30.

² *CJ* 17 (1922) 398.

³ *CR* 32 (1918) 164.

⁴ Cf. J. Whatmough, *Phoenix* 2 (1948) 65-72, on the "genitive of the sphere."

erally, as Henry took it, but also with specific reference to Aeneas' situation, if we take it as meaning "tears are in the class of real things." We may paraphrase: "Even here, on the remote and savage shore of Libya, renown has its due, and tears are real things, i.e. sympathy exists as part of the real world, not as a merely imagined consolation."

This interpretation frees *rerum* from vagueness without requiring a surreptitious importation of limiting adjectives, and it takes account of the emphatic position of *sunt*. A Virgilian dexterity and subtlety may also be seen in the way the idea latent in *sua*, "the reward which is its natural right," is picked up and amplified in *rerum*. Thus the phrase, without losing its universality, preserves a specific reference to Aeneas' situation, yet it is not merely an equivalent anticipation of *mentem mortalia tangunt*; and its tone is well in keeping with the pervading and distinctive pathos of Virgil.⁵

* * *

ausus quin etiam voces lactare per umbram
implevi clamore vias, maestusque Creusam
nequiquam ingeminans iterumque iterumque vocavi.
quaerenti et tectis urbis sine fine ruenti
infelix simulacrum atque ipsius umbra Creusae
visa mihi ante oculos et nota maior imago.

(Aen. 2.768-773)

In verse 771 the manuscripts read either *ruenti* or *furienti*; the lemma in Servius does not include the latter part of the line; Donatus reads *furienti*; editors are divided.

If we read *ruentis*, the meaning becomes "As I sought her even in the buildings of the city illimitably crumbling to ruin." This would bring out more clearly the climax of the search: first Aeneas dares to cry out Creusa's name in the dark streets; when this proves vain, he even searches the crumbling buildings of the devastated city, until Creusa's shade appears to him. *Tectis* will then depend on *quaerenti*, a more natural and easily understandable dependence than that on either *furienti* or *ruenti*; and *urbis sine fine ruentis* at once emphasizes Aeneas' desperation and danger, and admirably pictures the stricken city ceaselessly, everywhere, falling to ruin.

A possible explanation may be offered for the genesis of the variants. The better manuscript authority supports *ruenti*; but *furienti* has often been preferred by editors as the more expressive reading. We may suppose that *ruentis* lost its final consonant, either because or with the result that *et* was regarded as a mere connective joining two participles, instead of an intensifying connective linking two sentences or two clauses. Consequently, anyone dissatisfied with the line would tend to seek a substitute for *ruenti*, and someone, influenced doubtless by alliteration, found it in *furienti*.

* * *

⁵ Cf. Aen. 1.603-604 *si quid / usquam iustitia est*.

largus opum et lingua melior, sed frigida bello
dextera, consiliis habitus non futilis auctor,
seditione potens (genus huic materna superbum
mobilitas dabat, incertum de patre ferebat).

(Aen. 11.338-341)

Drances enjoys the distinction, unusual in Virgil, of a descriptive character-sketch. Such explicit description is not given to the important roles of Latinus, Amata, Evander, Turnus, or to such incidental characters as Mezentius, Nisus, Euryalus, Camilla. They are characterized by rather general references to strength or beauty, or by one particularly outstanding quality, as impiety or speed; the details that make up their individuality are left to be displayed in words and actions. Why is Drances singled out for an explicit portrait, and whence come the curiously precise details, not all of them essentially relevant to the part Drances is to play?

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is published weekly from mid-November for sixteen issues, except for any weeks in which there is an academic vacation. Volume 45 contains issues dated November 12, 26; December 3, 10, 17 (1951); January 7, 14, 21, 28; February 4, 25; March 3, 10, 17, 24, 31 (1952).

Owner and Publisher, The Classical Association of the Atlantic States. Place of Publication, Hunter College in the Bronx, 2900 Goulden Avenue, New York 68, N. Y.

General subscription price, \$3.75 per volume in the Western Hemisphere; elsewhere \$4.25. Price to members of the C. A. A. S., \$3.25. All subscriptions run by the volume. Single numbers, to subscribers, 20 cents, to others, 30 cents prepaid (otherwise 30 cents and 40 cents). If affidavit to invoice is required, 60 cents must be added to the subscription price. For residents of New York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Delaware, Maryland, and the District of Columbia, a subscription to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY (or, alternatively, to the *Classical Journal*) is included in the membership fee of the C. A. A. S., whose members are also entitled to the *Classical Outlook* and the *Classical Journal* at special prices in combinations available from the Secretary-Treasurer of the C. A. A. S., Eugene W. Miller, 3328 Cathedral of Learning, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh 13, Pa.

Reentered as second class matter December 14, 1950 at the post office at New York, N. Y., under the act of March 3, 1879. Acceptance for mailing at special rate of postage provided for in the Act of February 28, 1925 authorized December 14, 1950.

STAFF

EDITOR

Harry L. Levy.....Hunter College in the Bronx
2900 Goulden Avenue, New York 68, N. Y.

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Edward A. Robinson....Fordham University, New York 58, N. Y.
[On leave of absence, 1961-1962]
Ellenor Swallow.....Barnard College, New York 27, N. Y.

CONTRIBUTING EDITORS

Lionel Casson.....New York University, New York 3, N. Y.
William H. Stahl.....New York University, New York 53, N. Y.
Waldo E. Sweet....Wm. Penn Charter School, Philadelphia 44, Pa.

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Stanislaus Akielaszek....Fordham University, New York 58, N. Y.
[Also serves ad interim as C. A. A. S. Secretary
for Distribution of Publications]

Allusions to Cicero and reminiscence of Thersites and Polydamas have been suggested, and it is not impossible that they were in the back of Virgil's mind. But consider the qualities listed: generosity,⁶ eloquence, lack of military aptitude, shrewdness in council, skill in intrigue, pride in maternal descent. If we look directly at them, without preconception, they point almost unmistakably to one very prominent man of Virgil's own time—Maecenas.

Perhaps scholars have taken a too simple and unvaried view of the relations between Virgil and Maecenas, neither of them simple characters. Virgil may have been more touchy, Maecenas more trying than we have always allowed for. There may have been moments of exasperation, or even longer periods of estrangement, one of which was perpetuated in this spurt of ill-temper.

Maecenas' military record, defended by the *Elegies on Maecenas*, is fully discussed by M. C. Miller, the latest editor of these texts.⁷ She concludes that "the services of Maecenas as a soldier could be dispensed with much more readily than his services as a statesman." This is a polite equivalent for *frigida bello dextera, consiliis habitus non futilis auctor*. It is hard to pin down a specific reference in *seditione potens*, and perhaps no specific reference was intended; as Conington points out, Virgil could not use the word *factione*. The phrase may thus refer only to a general talent for political intrigue; Virgil uses *seditio* in *Aen.* 1.149 for almost normal political brawling: *cum saepe coorta est seditio*, turbulent indeed, but not implying treasonable conspiracy. Everything else fits Maecenas remarkably well, including the malicious and unusual detail of noble descent on the distaff side. Maecenas was mentioned in Virgil's will, on the same terms as Varius and Tucca; but we do not know when either the will or this passage was written. In any case, the passage, if it does refer to Maecenas, may commemorate, especially in an unrevised poem, rather a brief disagreement than a lasting alienation.

L. A. MacKAY

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

AWARD OF THE C. A. A. S. ROME SCHOLARSHIP FOR 1952

By unanimous vote of the Committee on the Rome Scholarship of the Classical Association of the Atlantic

⁶ *Largus opum* is taken by Mackail, as by Servius, as equivalent to *abundans opibus*, but Henry argues persuasively for the sense "a liberal giver." Conington sees an attempt to gain political influence through lavish use of wealth, like that of Pompey in Lucan's description.

⁷ M. C. Miller, *Elegiae in Maecenatem* (Philadelphia 1941) 114-121. The military record of Maecenas is championed by E. Bickel in *RAM* 93 (1950) 110-117. He regards the *Elegies* as contemporary documents commissioned by Lollius.

States, the award of the Association's scholarship for the 1952 Summer Session of the School of Classical Studies, American Academy in Rome, is made to Miss Hazel Beall, teacher of Latin in the Alice Deal Junior High School, Washington, D. C. Miss Beall completed an undergraduate major in Latin at the George Washington University in 1938, and earned an M. A. in Latin at the Catholic University of America in 1948. She has also done graduate work in Latin at Columbia University. Miss Beall has taught Latin at the Alice Deal Junior High School since 1939, except for the war years of 1943-1946, when she was on military leave as Chief of the Officers' Section of the WAC at Fort Lawton Staging Area, Seattle, Washington.

EMILIE MARGARET WHITE
Chairman of Committee

WASHINGTON, D. C.

REVIEWS

The Unwritten Philosophy and Other Essays. By F. M. CORNFORD. Edited with an Introductory Memoir by W. K. C. GUTHRIE. Cambridge: At the University Press, 1950. Pp. xx, 139. \$2.75.

The Greek Philosophers from Thales to Aristotle. By W. K. C. GUTHRIE. ("Home Study Books.") New York: Philosophical Library, 1950. Pp. v, 168. \$2.75.

All Cambridge men who studied under Francis MacDonald Cornford (1874-1943, late Laurence Professor of Ancient Philosophy and Fellow of Trinity College) appear to have regarded him with a feeling amounting to reverence. Those who did not have that privilege have long admired his scholarship and poetic imagination. Even if his early works on Thucydides and on the origin of Attic Comedy seemed too daring, or if his series of works on Greek religion and philosophy, culminating in four volumes dealing with Plato, lacked conventional caution, he had both learning and wisdom and a rare grace of style. His last book, a translation of Plato's *Republic* with introduction and notes, is probably the best of its kind for those who can not read Greek. He could on occasion poke fun at academic politicians (*Microcosmographia Academica*). But his great merit was to have recognized the underlying presuppositions of Greek or indeed of all serious thought. "In his later years," Mr. Guthrie tells us in his revealing Memoir, "he said that it sometimes seemed to him as if he had been all his life writing one and the same book." With this clue, one may perceive how the strands of the conscious and the unconscious, of scientific thought and ritual or myth, of conceptual and concrete expression,

distinguished by his historic sense with the aid of psychological and anthropological studies, had always been his concern. Yet he never lost sight of "the breathing and moving man."

Of the eight essays which are here collected, only three have been published before. In a score of places they meet or confirm one another. Guthrie has chosen for the title page the third essay, "The Unwritten Philosophy," as expressing the central idea of Cornford's "same book"; he could as easily have chosen the first, "The Unconscious Element in Literature and Philosophy." The second, "The Harmony of the Spheres," is a masterly and profoundly poetic application of the idea to a special topic. "Plato's Commonwealth" and "The Doctrine of Eros in Plato's *Symposium*" are exemplary interpretations of large ideas in small compass. "Greek Natural Philosophy and Modern Science" stresses chiefly the differences of the two approaches. "A Ritual Basis for Hesiod's *Theogony*" uses Biblical and Babylonian parallels to support a very plausible theory. "The Marxist View of Ancient Philosophy" courteously but most cogently refutes the views of B. Farrington and G. Thomson (who idealize Ionian speculation and Epicureanism and Prometheus as materialistic and scientific, as utilitarian and humanitarian, and as representing a popular movement, and who regard Plato as a sinister reactionary). By implication, he refutes also the first half of the more recent work of K. R. Popper, *The Open Society and Its Enemies*. The present volume is completed by a list of Cornford's publications on classical subjects (excluding reviews). If one could not know Cornford, this brief and delightfully written volume may serve as the best introduction to his singularly stimulating mind. It is as good for laymen as for scholars, for scholars as for laymen.

Mr. Guthrie (Lecturer in Classics at Cambridge, Public Orator, and Fellow of Peterhouse) is not only one of Cornford's heirs but an accomplished scholar in his own right, as his works on Orpheus and on *The Greeks and Their Gods* (London 1950) have already proved. We are now indebted to him both (as we have seen) for editing Cornford's essays and for a most useful brief introduction to Greek philosophy. This is intended for the general reader who knows no Greek and who is probably interested especially in quite different fields; in a word, it is to serve what we call "general education." Though it contains much familiar material, it is no ordinary compendium of information, but shows the novice how to step from our age into a different intellectual climate. Thus the first chapter, "Greek Ways of Thinking," is pedagogy of a high order. The remaining chapters deal with "Matter and Form (Ionians and Pythagoreans)," "The Problem of Motion (Heraclitus, Parmenides, and the Pluralists)," "The Reaction toward Humanism (The Sophists and Socrates)," "Plato: The Doctrine of Ideas," "Plato: Ethical and Theological An-

swers to the Sophists," "Aristotle: The Aristotelian Universe," and "Aristotle: Human Beings." No attempt is made to carry the account beyond Aristotle, and references to later European thought are few; the reader must bridge the gap for himself. The influence of Cornford is felt at many points; but the admirable organization, the selection of topics for emphasis, the clarity of expression, the occasional warnings that it is possible to hold another opinion than the one presented, are all Guthrie's. A few "Suggestions for Further Reading" fill the last two pages. Though the book is intended for the novice, even the experienced student will find it of service in reminding him of the major issues in Greek philosophic thought within the period that it covers.

WILLIAM C. GREENE

HARVARD UNIVERSITY

Méthode naturelle pour l'enseignement du grec. By I. PLAUT and S. DARRÉ. Sainte Pience, Manche, France, n. d. Pp. 48, 45.

Une année en Attique. By S. DARRÉ. Sainte Pience, Manche, France, n. d. Pp. 52.

The principles of the beginner's course in Greek, listed first above, are the same as those for the Latin course reviewed earlier in this volume (*CW* 45 [1951/52] 183-184). However, since the French student begins Greek in the Fourth Class, that is, after two years of Latin, the method is adapted to a relatively more mature mind and assumes a basic understanding of the principles of inflection.

The book is in two parts. Fascicule A contains reading keyed to the grammar lessons in Fascicule B. At the head of each reading assignment the authors have placed a simple reproduction of an example of Greek art, and the reading discusses these vase-paintings, statues, and the like in such a way as to include a survey of Greek history and civilization.

The course contains a fairly complete coverage of Greek forms and syntax, and should prepare a student effectively in one year for the study of the classical authors.

The other book is a Greek reader for the second year. It is organized into twelve parts, one for each month, and it follows the activities of an Attic farmer and his family through the year.

A large part of each chapter is devoted to appropriate quotations from the classical authors. Besides these, Mlle. Darré has set for each chapter specific review assignments in forms and grammar, as well as passages for composition. It is in these composition passages, which call for the use of vocabulary and constructions

met in the reading, and in the prefaces to the chapter, which are in French, that the activities of the Attic family appear. All the reading passages are from the ancient authors.

A summary of one chapter will best reveal the character of the book. Chapter 2, "Metageitnon," has at its head a reproduction of an ancient painting, "La Cueilleuse de Pommes." There follows in French an account of Democritides' farming activities during this time of the year, the harvest season, and of the activities of his family. These people are more than simple figures. The author has given them personalities, and the discussion of their interests and amusements permits an introductory discussion of the readings that follow.

After a review of relative, interrogative, and indefinite pronouns, the student finds three passages from Xenophon entitled "The Praise of Agriculture," "Pleasures of Rural Life," and "Agriculture Demands Hard Work," each followed by a short vocabulary. Then follows a short composition passage on the hard-working farmer and his lazy son.

We then come to a review of *eimi* (*sum*) and *eimi* (*tho*), followed by an excerpt from Longus entitled "A Country Garden" and a passage from a chorus of Aristophanes' *Birds*. Again, each has a vocabulary, and is followed by a composition passage.

The third part of the chapter begins with a review of *hiēmi*, followed by a passage from Xenophon and one from Homer, both on the subject of gardens. It ends with a third composition passage on the boastful son Cleophanes.

This organization has the advantage of presenting a variety of authors and of permitting an interesting study of life in fifth-century Attica. Each passage is long enough to include a complete idea. In fairness to the authors whose passages Mlle. Darré has selected to fit her own organization, it seems reasonable to suggest that she identify the passages rather than simply give the authors' names. This practice would at least give some hint of the scope and nature of the original and would perhaps encourage further study of it. Apart from this minor criticism, however, if it is granted that the study of Attic life in ancient times is a worthwhile pursuit, and that the use of classical authors gives the study genuineness and depth, the presentation of Greek reading by this method has much to recommend it.

PHILLIPS EXETER ACADEMY
EXETER, NEW HAMPSHIRE

W. E. GILLESPIE

CONTRIBUTE
TO THE C. A. A. S.
ROME SCHOLARSHIP FUND

Ipponatte nell'ambiente culturale e linguistico dell'Anatolia occidentale. Part I: "La formazione dell'ambiente ionica." By GIOVANNI NENCIONI. ("Mousikai Dialektoi," Suppl., Ser. 5, No. 2, Fasc. 1.) Bari: Adriatica Editrice, 1950. Pp. 221. L. 1200.

"Area and language study" have worn the center of the Classical Mediterranean fabric threadbare. The periphery still bears handling; especially the eastern end still shows a pattern not obscured by the constant thumbing of hundreds of would-be scholars ever since the fifteenth century. But the pattern of pre-Classical Anatolia is difficult to perceive beneath the superimposed Hellenism that begins with elegy and iambic. Even these are, in warp and woof, a less perfect tapestry to us than might have been. Hipponax runs to a bare twenty-four pages in Diehl. And Hipponax himself is to appear in Nencioni's second part. This first part is the background.

There are four chapters, of which the third, devoted to "stratigrafia linguistica," is longest (pp. 61-152). After a statement of the author's theme (7-10), we have an ethnographic and geographic account (13-20) of an "Anatolian triangle" based on a line from Lesbos to Cos, the apex at Mt. Dindymus; and, within it, of a smaller triangle, based on a line from Smyrna to Ephesus, its apex at Buladan. The first chapter (21-60) is concerned with the "stratigrafia culturale" of the "Anatolian triangle," the fourth (153-196) draws the threads together upon Ephesus. Both plan and execution are good, the combination of archaeological, linguistic, and traditional evidence wise. Indeed much of the second kind is of necessity known from epigraphic sources, and most of these obtained by archaeological research. The linguistic evidence contributes greatly to the interpretation of prehistory, and both to the tradition. Nencioni is right, therefore, to give a large part of his attention to the linguistic record.

Here he eschews the facile reconstructions of Oštir and his kind, which give most readers a headache. Moreover, in the fifty-five years that have passed since Kretschmer's *Einleitung* appeared the evidence has more than doubled—a brief account is to be found in *RE*, Suppl. 6 (1935) 165-181, but even it is now seventeen years old; and Götze's contribution (in Müller's *Handbuch* III 1 3 [1933]) is now nineteen. No one who professes to understand the Greek writers of Ionia can afford to neglect modern knowledge of their complex inheritance. Nencioni has given them a careful, up-to-date, readable, and, on the whole, trustworthy account; there is no excuse for the continued ignorance of many Hellenists.

JOSHUA WHATMOUGH

HARVARD UNIVERSITY

Princeton

UNIVERSITY PRESS

TROY

By **CARL W. BLEGEN, et al.**

The results of the University of Cincinnati excavations, presented in a series of profusely illustrated volumes and supplementary monographs. Published thus far:

Vol. I. General Introduction and the First and Second Settlements	\$36.00
Vol. II. Settlements Three, Four and Five	\$36.00
Supplementary Monograph 1. The Human Remains, by L. Angel	\$ 7.50

"What was needed was just such a record. . . . It will become the standard book of reference for all future work throughout the area of Aegean archaeology. So far as format is concerned it could hardly have been improved upon."—*Times Literary Supplement*. (London) Published for the University of Cincinnati.

ROMAN RULE IN ASIA MINOR

By **DAVID MAGIE**

A comprehensive organization of all existing scholarship on the expansion of Roman power into Asia and adjacent lands to the East between 133 B.C. and A.D. 285. Two volumes—one of text, one of notes—constitute a monumental contribution to the history of political and economic conditions in this period. "By integration of a tremendous body of source material with the results of almost a century of monographic research, these volumes produce an effective work of synthesis of the kind imperatively needed by current scholarship."—*U. S. Quarterly Book Review*. 2 vols., 1,661 pages. \$20.00

At your bookstore



PRINCETON University Press